

Paper Reviews

Paper Title: A SIP-based Web Session Migration Service

Paper #: 18

Paper Selection State: Short Paper

My Status: Author

Number of Reviews: 3

Review #: 1

Abstract and Introduction are adequate?		Too short
Conclusions/Future Work are convincing?		Yes
Figures are Adequate ?	in number and quality	Yes
Improve critical discussion ?	validation	Yes
Improve English?		No
Needs comparative evaluation?		Yes
Needs more experimental results?		Yes
Originality	Newness of the ideas expressed	3
Overall rating	Weighted value of above items	3
Paper formatting needs adjustment?		No
Presentation	Structure/Length/English	3
References are up-to-date and appropriate?		Yes
Relevance	Paper fits one or more of the topic areas?	4
Reviewer's knowledge of the area and confidence	on the scores assigned	Average
Significance	Is the problem worth the given attention?	3
Technical Quality	Theoretical soundness/methodology	3

Scale: 1:Lowest Value;6:Highest Value

The introduction is somewhat confusing. Many fundamental details about implementation are missing. The approach fails to migrate sessions when other methods than forms or cookies are used to maintain the state of the session in a web application. Section VII is not an “evaluation of the TransferHTTP extension” as stated but a

“features comparison” against other methods.

Review #: 2

Abstract and Introduction are adequate?		Yes
Conclusions/Future Work are convincing?		Yes
Figures are Adequate ?	in number and quality	Yes
Improve critical discussion ?	validation	Yes
Improve English?		No
Needs comparative evaluation?		No
Needs more experimental results?		No
Originality	Newness of the ideas expressed	4
Overall rating	Weighted value of above items	4
Paper formatting needs adjustment?		No
Presentation	Structure/Length/English	5
References are up-to-date and appropriate?		Yes
Relevance	Paper fits one or more of the topic areas?	6
Reviewer's knowledge of the area and confidence	on the scores assigned	Low
Significance	Is the problem worth the given attention?	4
Technical Quality	Theoretical soundness/methodology	5

Scale: 1:Lowest Value;6:Highest Value

Interesting and sound, but very technical paper. It would help the reader to explain more clearly the advantages of the proposed mechanism from the users' point of view.

Review #: 3

Abstract and Introduction are adequate?		Yes
Conclusions/Future Work are convincing?		Yes
Figures are Adequate ?	in number and quality	Yes
Improve critical discussion ?	validation	Yes
Improve English?		No

Needs comparative evaluation?		No
Needs more experimental results?		No
Originality	Newness of the ideas expressed	3
Overall rating	Weighted value of above items	5
Paper formatting needs adjustment?		No
Presentation	Structure/Length/English	5
References are up-to-date and appropriate?		Yes
Relevance	Paper fits one or more of the topic areas?	5
Reviewer's knowledge of the area and confidence	on the scores assigned	High
Significance	Is the problem worth the given attention?	5
Technical Quality	Theoretical soundness/methodology	5

Scale: 1:Lowest Value;6:Highest Value

This is a good, well written, paper which describes a technique for transferring web sessions between browsers using SIP. While the concept or approach is not new, it presents a hybrid technique that sits between existing host-based and web-based techniques. Would recommend accepting this work as a short regular paper.